## Technical Comments

TECHNICAL COMMENTS are brief discussions of papers previously published in this journal. They should not exceed 1500 words (where a figure or table counts as 200 words). The author of the previous paper is invited to submit a reply for publication in the same issue as the Technical Comment. These discussions are published as quickly as possible after receipt of the manuscripts. Neither AIAA nor its Editors are responsible for the opinions expressed by the authors.

## Reply by the Authors to C. F. Lü and W. Q. Chen

J. F. Yu\*

Chung San Medical University,
Taichung 402, Taiwan, Republic of China
and
B. B. Wong<sup>†</sup>

B. P. Wang<sup>†</sup>

University of Texas at Arlington, Arlington, Texas 76019

N our paper,<sup>1</sup> we presented a general method for free vibration analysis of three-dimensional frames based on Timoshenko beam theory using the exact transfer dynamic stiffness matrix. We appreciate the comments by Lu and Chen<sup>2</sup> regarding the numerical instability of the dynamic analysis in transfer matrix method. They concluded that "We hope, through this Comment, the reader, who is not familiar with the history of structural matrix method widely used in 1950–1960s, will become aware of this numerical instabil-

ity. Several effective, although not universal, methods have been proposed to overcome the difficulty, as summarized by Pestel and Leckie." However, we do not experience any numerical instability. The following is a brief explanation of this fact.

In our method, the eigenvalues are not calculated by evaluation of the determinant as the transfer matrix. In fact, our method is based on the algorithm developed by Wittrick and Williams.<sup>3</sup> In this method, the eigenvalues are computed by a generalized Sturm sequence property of the dynamic matrix. This is achieved by triangularization of the symmetric dynamic stiffness matrix, and the number of eigenvalues can be estimated by sign changes of the diagonal terms. Thus, in our method, we do not need to evaluate any determinant. For details of this method, please refer to Ref. 4. Because matrix triangularization is a stable numerical procedure, we believe that is why we do not encounter any numerical instability in our calculations.

## References

<sup>1</sup>Yu, J.-F., Lien, H.-C., and Wang, B. P., "Exact Dynamic Analysis of Space Structures Using Timoshenko Beam Theory," *AIAA Journal*, Vol. 42, No. 4, 2004, pp. 833–839.

<sup>2</sup>Lü, C. F., and Chen, W. Q., "Comment on 'Exact Dynamic Analysis of Space Structures Using Timoshenko Beam Theory," *AIAA Journal*, Vol. 44, No. 6, 2006, pp. 1372, 1373.

<sup>3</sup>Wittrick, W. H., and Williams, F. W., "A General Algorithm for Computing Natural Frequencies of Elastic Structures," *Quarterly Journal of Mechanics and Applied Mathematics*, Vol. 24, 1971, pp. 263–284.

<sup>4</sup>Yu, J. F., "Vibration and Sensitivity Analysis of Structures with Optimal Design Using Transfer Dynamic Stiffness Matrix Method," Ph.D. Dissertation, Univ. of Texas, Arlington, TX, 2001.

A. Berman Associate Editor

Received 7 December 2005; accepted for publication 15 December 2005. Copyright © 2006 by the American Institute of Aeronautics and Astronautics, Inc. All rights reserved. Copies of this paper may be made for personal or internal use, on condition that the copier pay the \$10.00 per-copy fee to the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923; include the code 0001-1452/06 \$10.00 in correspondence with the CCC.

<sup>\*</sup>Assistant Professor, Number 110, Section 1, Chien-kuo North Road.
†Professor, Box 19023, Department of Mechanical and Aerospace Engi-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>†</sup>Professor, Box 19023, Department of Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering.